Quantification of Strain Induced Damage in Medial Collateral Ligaments

In the past years, there have been several experimental studies that aimed at quantifying the material properties of articular ligaments such as tangent modulus, tensile strength, and ultimate strain. Little has been done to describe their response to mechanical stimuli that lead to damage. The purpose of this experimental study was to characterize strain-induced damage in medial collateral ligaments (MCLs). Displacement-controlled tensile tests were performed on 30 MCLs harvested from Sprague Dawley rats. Each ligament was monotonically pulled to several increasing levels of displacement until complete failure occurred. The stress–strain data collected from the mechanical tests were analyzed to determine the onset of damage and its evolution. Unrecoverable changes such as increase in ligament’s elongation at preload and decrease in the tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curves indicated the occurrence of damage. Interestingly, these changes were found to appear at two significantly different threshold strains \(P < 0.05\). The mean threshold strain that determined the increase in ligament’s elongation at preload was found to be 2.84 (standard deviation (SD) = 1.29\%) and the mean threshold strain that caused the decrease in the tangent modulus of the linear region was computed to be 5.51\% (SD = 2.10\%). The findings of this study suggest that the damage mechanisms associated with the increase in ligament’s elongation at preload and decrease in the tangent modulus of the linear region in the stress–strain curves in MCLs are likely different. [DOI: 10.1115/1.4030532]

1 Introduction

Sprains of knee ligaments are among the most common orthopedic injuries. They often occur when the ligaments are subjected to loads and deformations that are below their ultimate capacity but above some damage thresholds. While many investigators in biomechanics have focused on characterizing the ultimate loads and deformations of knee ligaments, little has been done to determine their mechanical damage thresholds. This is, perhaps, due to the lack of standardized methods in biomechanics for defining and measuring damage in collagenous tissues. Identifying and quantifying damage in ligaments is, however, crucial for the development of replacement grafts, bracing devices, and safe stretching routines. Replacement grafts must sustain the in vivo loads or deformations of native ligaments in order perform their function, without being damaged. Bracing devices must provide protection to the sprained ligaments during healing, and they must limit loads or deformations that lead to further damage. Finally, stretching routines for athletes must be carefully modulated to avoid the occurrence of ligament sprains during sport activities. For these reasons, new standardized methods are necessary to detect and evaluate loads and deformations that induce damage (not complete rupture) in ligaments.

Over the past few years, several studies have been carried out on different types of collagenous tissues to investigate damage through fatigue experiments [1–8]. In these studies, different damage parameters were defined in order to quantify the unrecoverable changes in the stress–strain or load–deformation curve of each fatigue cycle. In an earlier study by Wang et al. [6] on tendons, the decrease in cyclic peak stress was employed to detect fatigue damage. Similarly, King et al. [2] and Pollock et al. [3] used the decrease in cyclic peak load over the testing period as damage indicator in ligaments. Fatigue damage in ligaments and tendons was detected by estimating the decrease in stiffness [6], dynamic tensile modulus [4], secant modulus [7,8], or tangent modulus of the linear region [5] at each fatigue cycle. The reduction in stiffness/modulus measured as the number of fatigue cycles increased during testing was used as fatigue damage parameter. Moreover, the increase in ligament’s length [3] or the clamp-to-clamp strain [1], and the elongation of the toe region [2,7], reported as the number of fatigue cycles increased, were also measured to study the damage evolution process. In the above cited studies, the damage on ligaments and tendons was, however, cumulative being produced by fatigue cycles.

There are a few studies that focus on determining damage in knee ligaments induced by monotonic tensile tests [9–11]. Monotonic tensile testing emulates the mechanical stimuli that produce sprains better than fatigue testing. Clinically, knee ligaments are often damaged after being loaded or deformed above some damage thresholds during single traumatic events. Panjabi et al. [9] conducted monotonic tensile tests on rabbit anterior cruciate ligaments (ACLs) at high (~1 m/s) and low (~1 mm/s) deformation rates. In their studies, each ligament was pulled to a subfailure
deformation defined as 80% of the failure deformation. This failure deformation was computed from the paired contralateral ligament. The subfailure deformation produced an elongation of the load–deformation curve that was quantified by comparing the deformation of each pair of ACLs at different load levels. It also produced a change in stiffness computed at 50% of the failure load. Panjabi et al. [12] also compared the effect of a single subfailure stretch and a series of incremental subfailure stretches that ended at the same stretch value on the mechanical behavior of rabbit ACLs. They observed no significant difference in the load–deformation curves and viscoelastic properties of two groups of ligaments that were tested with the two different damage stretching protocols (single subfailure stretch and incremental subfailure stretches).

Damage thresholds were determined by Provenzano et al. [11] in rat MCLs by applying different subfailure stretches to different specimens, with each specimen receiving a single subfailure stretch. The unrecoverable increase in the preload length of the ligament subjected to a subfailure stretch was defined as structural damage. The structural damage data from different experiments performed by imposing different subfailure stretches on MCLs were calculated and fit to a linear model to obtain a strain of 5.14% that indicated the onset of damage.

In this study, the damage evolution process in rat MCLs was investigated by performing displacement-controlled tensile tests. The ligaments were subjected to monotonically increasing displacements. The unrecoverable changes in stress–strain curves were quantified and correlated with the strain corresponding to the applied incremental displacements. The proposed experimental protocol could provide a more accurate evaluation of strain-based damage thresholds for ligaments when compared to other protocols. Indeed, the damage thresholds were computed for each specimen and were not extrapolated from results obtained by testing different samples to different subfailure strains [11]. The evaluation of damage did not rely on the assumption of biomechanical symmetry of paired knee ligaments used in previous studies [9,10] and, hence, required the sacrifice of fewer animals. The outcome of this study may help the fields of orthopedics, sports medicine, and athletic training. For example, knowledge about strain-based damage thresholds for ligaments could be used to prevent or treat sprains and other injuries caused by mechanical stimuli.

2 Materials and Methods

This study was conducted in accordance with applicable laws, regulations, guidelines, and policies (i.e., the U.S. Animal Welfare Act, Public Health Service Policy, U.S. Government Principles, and the Guide for the Care and Use of Laboratory Animals). All procedures were conducted with approval of the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee at Virginia Tech. Sixteen Sprague Dawley male rats were purchased from Harlan Laboratories (Frederick, MD). The mean age of the rats was 84 days (SD = 3 days) and the mean body weight was 342 g (SD = 15 g). These rats are considered to be adult [13]. They were euthanized with 4 ml of Beuthanasia D solution (1560 mg pentobarbital sodium, 200 mg phenytoin sodium) by intraperitoneal injection. Immediately postmortem, the femur–MCL–tibia complexes (FMTCs) were carefully dissected from the hind limbs, wrapped in gauze moistened with phosphate buffered saline solution, sealed in plastic, and stored frozen (-20°C).

Before mechanical testing, the FMTCs were thawed at room temperature. The soft tissues around the knee joints were removed to expose the MCLs, while keeping them hydrated by constantly spraying phosphate buffered saline solution on their surface. Black ink was then sprayed on the surface of the MCLs by using an airbrush (Badger Model 150, Franklin Park, IL) to produce markers with suitable contrast for strain calculation (Fig. 1(b)). The ligaments were subjected to a subfailure stretch and a series of incremental subfailure stretches that ended at the same stretch value on the mechanical behavior of rabbit ACLs. They observed no significant difference in the load–deformation curves and viscoelastic properties of two groups of ligaments that were tested with the two different damage stretching protocols (single subfailure stretch and incremental subfailure stretches).

Damage thresholds were determined by Provenzano et al. [11] in rat MCLs by applying different subfailure stretches to different specimens, with each specimen receiving a single subfailure stretch. The unrecoverable increase in the preload length of the ligament subjected to a subfailure stretch was defined as structural damage. The structural damage data from different experiments performed by imposing different subfailure stretches on MCLs were calculated and fit to a linear model to obtain a strain of 5.14% that indicated the onset of damage.

In this study, the damage evolution process in rat MCLs was investigated by performing displacement-controlled tensile tests. The ligaments were subjected to monotonically increasing displacements. The unrecoverable changes in stress–strain curves were quantified and correlated with the strain corresponding to the applied incremental displacements. The proposed experimental protocol could provide a more accurate evaluation of strain-based damage thresholds for ligaments when compared to other protocols. Indeed, the damage thresholds were computed for each specimen and were not extrapolated from results obtained by testing different samples to different subfailure strains [11]. The evaluation of damage did not rely on the assumption of biomechanical symmetry of paired knee ligaments used in previous studies [9,10] and, hence, required the sacrifice of fewer animals. The outcome of this study may help the fields of orthopedics, sports medicine, and athletic training. For example, knowledge about strain-based damage thresholds for ligaments could be used together with current elastography techniques to prevent and treat sprains and other injuries caused by mechanical stimuli.

Fig. 1 (a) FMTC attached to a frame made of a polyethylene terephthalate sheet at a 70-deg flexion. (b) MCL with black ink sprayed on its surface. Two ink markers were selected for strain measurement. (c) FMTC mounted on the tensile testing device.

This study was conducted in accordance with applicable laws, regulations, guidelines, and policies (i.e., the U.S. Animal Welfare Act, Public Health Service Policy, U.S. Government Principles, and the Guide for the Care and Use of Laboratory Animals). All procedures were conducted with approval of the Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee at Virginia Tech. Sixteen Sprague Dawley male rats were purchased from Harlan Laboratories (Frederick, MD). The mean age of the rats was 84 days (SD = 3 days) and the mean body weight was 342 g (SD = 15 g). These rats are considered to be adult [13]. They were euthanized with 4 ml of Beuthanasia D solution (1560 mg pentobarbital sodium, 200 mg phenytoin sodium) by intraperitoneal injection. Immediately postmortem, the femur–MCL–tibia complexes (FMTCs) were carefully dissected from the hind limbs, wrapped in gauze moistened with phosphate buffered saline solution, sealed in plastic, and stored frozen (-20°C).

Before mechanical testing, the FMTCs were thawed at room temperature. The soft tissues around the knee joints were removed to expose the MCLs, while keeping them hydrated by constantly spraying phosphate buffered saline solution on their surface. Black ink was then sprayed on the surface of the MCLs by using an airbrush (Badger Model 150, Franklin Park, IL) to produce markers with suitable contrast for strain calculation (Fig. 1(a)). The width and thickness of the MCL cross section were measured optically using images taken by a digital camera (Nikon D5000) under a dissection stereoscope (Zeiss Stemi 2000 C). Measurements were taken at three different locations and averaged. The cross-sectional areas of the MCLs were calculated by assuming elliptical cross sections.

A strip of fiberglass was attached to the femur of each FMTC using cyanoacrylate glue to reinforce its growth plate, while several notches were created on the tibia to enhance gripping (Fig. 1(b)). The tibia and femur in each FMTC were attached to a frame made of a polyethylene terephthalate sheet at a 70-deg flexion to ensure that the MCL was loaded in its anatomic direction [14,15]. The femur, tibia, and plastic frame were potted with bone cement in two hose barbs.

The hose barbs were secured to the mechanical grips of a universal tensile testing machine (Instron Electropuls E1000) with vertical mounting. The load cell used had a capacity of 250 N and resolution of 0.001 N. The tibial end of the FMTCs was attached to the upper grip connected to the load cell and the femoral end to the lower grip fixed to a supporting table. Special care was taken to ensure that the FMTCs were aligned along the axis of the load cell. The plastic frames holding the bones were then cut and the FMTCs and grips were immersed in a custom designed bath filled with phosphate buffered saline solution at room temperature (~21°C) (Fig. 1(c)).

During testing, the load data were recorded by the load cell of the tensile testing machine. For each MCL the nominal stress data

![Image](image-url)
The Green-Lagrangian strain data in the direction of assuming that the MCL underwent uniform extension. Thus, the displacements starting from a 0 N load state. The change in elongation of the MCL that occurred when loading the MCL up to the displacement \( d_k \) for \( k = 1, 2, 3, \ldots \) was quantified by measuring the difference, \( \Delta e_k^{(1)} \), between the strain at 0.1 N load, \( e_0^{(1)} \), obtained by loading the specimen up to the displacement \( d_k \), and the strain at 0.1 N load, \( e_0^{(1)} \), obtained by loading the specimen up to the displacement \( d_k = 0.45 \) mm (see Fig. 3(d) for an example). With this notation \( \Delta e_k^{(1)} = e_0^{(1)} - e_0^{(1)} = 0 \). Due to noise in the strain measurement, the increase in elongation at 0.1 N was assumed to occur only when \( \Delta e_k^{(1)} > 0.1\% \).

The 0.1 N load was chosen as the preload value in order to eliminate the slack in the MCLs and standardize their initial configuration. The strain in the MCLs was then recalculated with respect to this initial configuration. The strain corresponding to the maximum load achieved with each loading up to the displacement \( d_k \), \( e_{\text{max}}^{(k)} \), and the tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve, \( E_k^{(k)} \), were computed (see Fig. 3(c) for an example). The tangent modulus was defined as the slope of the best fit line of portion of the linear region of the stress–strain curve using the method of least squares. The linear portion of the stress–strain curve was determined by damage that occurred during the previous loadings. The visual noise was measured to be approximately 0.07% at 0 N load using the outlier detection method with 1.5 interquartile range.

Displacement-controlled tensile tests were performed on the 30 MCLs. The experimental protocol is schematically presented in Fig. 2. First, each MCL was preconditioned with ten stretching cycles up to 0.3 mm at 1 Hz in order to provide a consistent loading history among all the tested MCLs. This number of cycles was chosen based on previous studies. Then, it was unloaded to –0.05 mm displacement to assure that the initial load state was at 0 N, and allowed to recover for 10 min. After preconditioning and starting from a 0 N load state, the MCL was loaded to a set of increasing displacements, \( d_k \), where \( k = 1, 2, 3, \ldots \) and \( d_{k+1} - d_k = 0.2 \) mm, at a displacement rate of 0.1 mm/s until failure occurred. Between consecutive loads at increasing displacements the MCL was unloaded and allowed to recover from creep for 10 min. Figure 3(a) shows an example of the stress–strain curves for one MCL that is loaded to four consecutive displacements starting from a 0 N load state.
indicating the increase in elongation at preload and the decrease formed to determine the difference between the threshold strains of the linear region first occurred. Statistical analysis was per-

Fig. 5 Load and strain data of the initial nonlinear region for the stress–strain data presented in Fig. 4. The change in elongation at the 0.1 N load (preload) is measured by $\Delta e_{0.1N}^{k}$ for $k = 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6$. This quantity is defined as the difference between the strain at 0.1 N load measured when loading the specimen up to the displacement $d_{k}$ and the strain at 0.1 N load measured when loading the same specimen up to the displacement $d_{1} = 0.45$ mm, $e_{0.1N}^{1}$. For example, $\Delta e_{0.1N}^{5}$ is computed as shown. This increase in elongation was assumed to be induced by the displacement $d_{5}$ (or the strain $e_{\max}^{5}$).

The typical stress–strain data collected when testing 1 of the 30 FMTCs are shown in Fig. 4. Each of the six stress–strain curves reported in Fig. 4 was obtained by loading the FMTC to consecutive displacements $d_{k}$ for $k = 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6$ starting from a 0 N load reference configuration and using the methods and protocol previously described. It can be clearly seen that, as the displacement $d_{k}$ increased, the initial nonlinear region of the stress–strain curve becomes more extended, while the tangent modulus of the linear region decreases. In this study, we assumed that these changes in the tensile response of the MCL after consecutive loadings up to different and increasing displacements indicated the initiation and propagation of damage.

For each FMTC, the change in elongation at preload was quantified by measuring $\Delta e_{0.1N}^{k}$, as defined in Sec. 2, for each loading up to the displacement $d_{k}$. It must emphasized again that we assumed that $\Delta e_{0.1N}^{k}$, which was measured during the loading up to the displacement $d_{k}$, was caused by the previous loading up to the displacement $d_{k-1}$ and, thus, was associated with the

3 Results

The typical stress–strain data collected when testing 1 of the 30 FMTCs are shown in Fig. 4. Each of the six stress–strain curves...
corresponding strain $e^{(k-1)}_\text{max}$. For the representative stress–strain curve presented in Fig. 4, the load and strain data of the initial nonlinear region that were used to compute $\Delta_{\text{inel}}^{(k)}$ are presented in Fig. 5 (for example, $\Delta_{\text{inel}}^{(5)}$ was computed as shown in Fig. 5 and was associated with the strain $e^{(4)}_\text{max}$). For each loading up to the displacement $d_k$, the strain corresponding to the maximum load achieved, $e^{(k)}_\text{max}$, and the tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve, $E^{(k)}$, were computed with data determined using the 0.1 N preload as the undeformed configuration. For the data reported in Fig. 4, the stress–strain data computed using the 0.1 N preload state as the undeformed configuration are shown in Fig. 6.

For the selected representative FMTC, $\Delta_{\text{inel}}^{(k)}$ and $E^{(k)}$ computed from the stress–strain data presented in Figs. 4–6 are plotted versus $e^{(k-1)}_\text{max}$ for $k = 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6$. The results presented in Fig. 7 indicated that the increase in ligament’s elongation at preload and the decrease in tangent modulus denoted with a filled circular symbol and a filled squared symbol, respectively, initiated at two very different threshold strains. Specifically, the increase in elongation at preload began at a smaller strain than the decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve, $E^{(k)}$, were computed with data determined using the 0.1 N preload as the undeformed configuration. For the data reported in Fig. 4, the stress–strain data computed using the 0.1 N preload state as the undeformed configuration are shown in Fig. 6.

The threshold strains from 30 FMTCs are reported in Fig. 8 in a box plot. The mean value of the strain associated with the elongation at preload was found to be 2.84% (SD = 1.29%), while the mean value of the strain associated with the decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region was determined to be 5.51% (SD = 2.10%). Again, one can observe that the elongation at preload occurred at lower threshold strain than the decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region. Statistical results showed that there was a significant difference between the threshold strain indicating the increase in elongation at preload and the threshold strain indicating the decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve of MCLs ($P < 0.05$).

4 Discussion

In this study, mechanical damage in ligaments was investigated by performing displacement-controlled tensile tests on MCLs excised from rats. The MCLs were stretched to gradually increasing displacements until complete failure occurred. Unrecoverable changes such as the increase in ligament’s elongation at preload and decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region of the collected stress–strain curves indicated the initiation and propagation of damage. The threshold strains that produced these changes were computed and their average values were found to be significantly different.

Previous studies on cyclic loading and stretching of parallel-fibered collagenous tissues suggested that the elongation at preload or, equivalently, the increase in tissue’s length [1–3,7] and decrease in modulus or stiffness of the linear region of the stress–strain or load–displacement curve [4–6,8] are indicators of tissues’ damage. Experiments conducted by stretching these tissues monotonically also produced similar results [9,11]. Thus, our experimental data confirmed the findings of previous studies while also providing strain-based damage thresholds. In our study, the threshold strain for the increase in elongation at preload and decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve were found to be significantly different (Fig. 8). For example, from Figs. 5 and 7, these data from one representative MCL, one can clearly note the increase in elongation at preload during the fourth loading up to the displacement $d_1$ and the decrease in tangent modulus during the sixth loading up to the displacement $d_6$. In our analysis, we assumed that these changes were the result of damage that occurred during the third and fifth loadings up to the displacement $d_3$ and $d_5$, respectively. The strain values that correspond to these displacements, $e^{(3)}_\text{max} = 4.62\%$ and $e^{(5)}_\text{max} = 6.22\%$, were found to be significantly different. Our study is the first to report such difference in strain-based damage thresholds. It is possible that different microstructural alterations trigger the different unrecoverable changes that we observed in the elongation at preload and tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve of the ligaments.

To our knowledge, there is only one experimental study by Provenzano et al. [11] in which the threshold strain for structural damage was determined by monotonic tensile tests on MCLs isolated from Sprague Dawley rats. In this study, each MCL was subjected to a single stretch, unloaded, allowed to recover from creep, and then stretched to failure. Structural damage was defined by the authors as the change in ligament’s length measured at a 0.1 N preload produced by a single stretch. The authors estimated that such damage initiates at 5.14% strain by analyzing the results obtained by testing 25 MCLs using methods described in detail in their manuscript. According to a study by Panjabi et al. [12], single and incremental subfailure stretches are mechanically equivalent, producing the same alterations in the mechanical properties of ligaments. Thus, the protocol we adopted in this study is mechanically equivalent to the protocol used by Provenzano et al. [11]. The decrease in tangent modulus in our study was found to occur at a mean threshold strain (mean = 5.51%, SD = 2.10%) that was comparable with the threshold strain reported by Provenzano et al. [11]. The difference between these strains are, most probably, due to the different methods (e.g., a single stretch versus multiple stretches) used to define and determine the onset of structural damage. For example, in the study by Provenzano et al. [11], the decrease in tangent modulus was quantified together with the increase in ligament’s length. By using our methods, the increase in elongation at 0.1 N preload, which is caused by the increase in ligament’s length, was found to occur at much lower threshold strain (mean = 2.84%, SD = 1.29%) than the decrease in tangent modulus. For this reason, these threshold strains were not lumped together. We believe that, because our protocol offers more information about the progression of strain-induced damage by applying multiple consecutive stretches to the MCL, it likely provides a more accurate determination of threshold strains [12].

In our experiments, failure of the FMTCs upon stretching occurred mostly at the tibial insertion site. The failure near or at the insertion site is likely determined by the morphology of the FMTCs. In Sprague Dawley rats up to 120 days of age, the MCL inserts into the tibia only through the peristeme with no fibrocartilage zone [16]. Due to the absence of the fibrocartilage zone, the tibial insertion site is the weakest region in the MCLs and, consequently, failure occurs commonly at this site during mechanical testing. Our findings are consistent with recent studies on the effect of cyclic stretching on FMTCs isolated from older Sprague Dawley rats [17], where failure was also reported to occur near the tibial insertion. Given the MCL mode of failure, we cannot exclude the possibility that the damage we measured was the damage of the insertion site of the MCL. The low strain rate (0.1 mm/s) used in our study may have also played a critical role on the failure mode. Indeed, a few studies have suggested that high strain rates are more likely to produce failure at the mid substance in rat MCLs [18,19].

It is speculated that the increase elongation at preload and the decrease in tangent modulus of the linear region of the stress–strain curve are determined by different microstructural alterations that are induced by strain in ligaments. It is well known that the tensile response of ligaments in the initial nonlinear region is mainly due to the uncrimping of the collagen fibrils [20]. Thus, it is possible that the increase in elongation at preload is caused by the plastic deformation and formation of kinks in collagen fibrils and fibers [1]. The decrease in tangent modulus can be, probably, attributed to the breakage of groups of collagen fibrils or entire fibers in the ligamentous tissue. Future studies will be conducted by the authors to reveal the microstructural origin of fibrils and fibers [1].
damage in MCLs by combining mechanical testing with scanning electron microscopy.

Acknowledgment
This material is based upon work supported by the National Science Foundation under Grant No. 0932024.

References